



8 Holyrood Street, London SE1 2EL  
020-7939 6030  
[info@makingmusic.org.uk](mailto:info@makingmusic.org.uk)  
[www.makingmusic.org.uk](http://www.makingmusic.org.uk)

## Consultation on music education with Making Music members, May/June 2018

### Contents:

1	<b>Executive Summary</b>	<b>p1</b>
2	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>p3</b>
3	<b>Background to the consultation</b>	<b>p3</b>
4	<b>The landscape of music education</b>	<b>p6</b>
5	<b>The results of Making Music's member consultation – the basics</b>	<b>p6</b>
6	<b>Under-18s music education – barriers and how to address them</b>	<b>p7</b>
7	<b>Adult music education – challenges &amp; how to overcome them</b>	<b>p10</b>
8	<b>Music Education Hubs and leisure-time music groups</b>	<b>p12</b>

### 1 Executive Summary

Two consecutive member surveys have told us music education is an important issue for Making Music members – overwhelmingly adult leisure-time music groups – and one on which they'd like Making Music to take action.

But what is the most appropriate action, and what are members' greatest concerns? Where do they see the biggest challenges, and are they ones Making Music is best placed to tackle itself or ones on which we should be collaborating with or supporting other organisations' work? Finding that out was therefore the first aim of the survey.

And: what is music education? It is sometimes debated as if it stops at 18, unless you are going on to become a professional musician. That is of course not so, as shown by the estimated 800,000 individuals participating in leisure-time music groups throughout the UK on a regular basis. Are they not learners? Do they not need support, training, development, and progression opportunities?

Our second aim was to identify what the barriers are to music education for over-18s, and

how they might be overcome.

Finally, the government review of the National Plan for Music Education, the Music Education Council's consultation on this and ABRSM's recent Music Commission have all further encouraged us to get a better view of what our members think, and to start the debate on how Making Music and its members are best placed to support music education and to advocate for it with relevant policy-makers, both for under- and over-18s.

### ***What are the findings?***

#### **Music education for under-18s should above all:**

- inspire a love of music
- enable every child, regardless of background, to access music
- and give children the opportunity to listen and learn to appreciate music.

As one respondent pointed out, if you don't know what's out there, you might not find the music that's for you. Respondents agreed that ***inspiration*** and ***appreciation*** come first – and ***for everyone***. Access is a recurring theme throughout the responses to all questions.

#### **The biggest barriers for under-18s in music education are:**

- ***cost*** (in or outside school: lessons, instruments/equipment, price of gigs/concerts, i.e. exposure to live music),
- the ***benefits of music participation not being understood by parents or non-music school staff***, including the senior leadership team,
- ***lack of extra-curricular opportunities***

It makes sense that where schools don't provide access to pupils with free lessons, instruments and extra-curricular activities – maybe because school leaders are unaware of the benefits – young people whose parents are also unaware of these benefits will almost definitely miss out because they do not have a family 'compensating' for the lack of opportunities on offer from their educational establishment.

**The single biggest barrier to participation in musical activity for over-18s is lack of confidence**, in all age groups and in all abilities – whether complete beginners or returners. The second surprise perhaps was the issue of practice space. Other challenges were more expected, such as lack of opportunities or lack of awareness of them, lack of time, and cost.

#### **Solutions can be found:**

Suggestions include providing inspiration to take up or return to music (with 'people like you'); 'trigger events' which enable 'having a go' at music in a non-intimidating setting; music education hubs widening their remit to include over-18s; employers playing their part by providing practice space; and developing the idea of peer-to-peer learning to instil confidence.

#### **Music education hubs:**

There were no surprises here, only confirmation of our previous anecdotal evidence that ***they overwhelmingly do not interact, with notable exceptions, with music groups in their communities.***

66% of respondents had had no contact with their music education hubs in the six years of

the hubs' existence.

Given that the overwhelming majority of the under-18s will not become professional musicians, and seeing the now abundant evidence for the benefits of music-making in terms of adult mental and physical well-being, it is disappointing that there is not at least mutual awareness and signposting between hubs and community-based music groups.

The notable exceptions we know of go beyond such signposting, and have built mutually beneficial partnerships which allow the hubs to use the expertise, enthusiasm and goodwill of music groups to support 5-18 year olds, and which allow groups to share the rich and varied musical activity they engage in with a new generation of potential recruits and audiences on their doorstep.

### ***What will Making Music do with these findings?***

We plan to:

- **Publicise and disseminate them** and use them to ensure debates on music education include adult learners and consider the role of music groups in the community
- **Draw up recommendations for action by Making Music members** to support issues in under-18s music education
- **Develop plans for Making Music to work on removing barriers to over-18s music education** exploring relevant partnerships and projects, and what Making Music members could do
- **Talk to music education hubs** and their funding channel, Arts Council England, on behalf of members, and encourage members to contact their local hub.

## **2 Introduction**

***Making Music***, founded in 1935 and a registered charity in England, Wales and Scotland, is the UK wide body for leisure-time music groups, numbering in membership nearly 3,500 such groups, representing around 190,000 individuals involved in those groups.

***Our members are:*** 59% vocal groups (choral societies, community choirs, gospel choirs, youth choirs etc.), 28% instrumental groups (amateur orchestras, brass bands, folk and ukulele groups, jazz ensembles, handbell ringers, drummers and more), 13% volunteer promoters (presenting professional musicians, but run and programmed by volunteers).

***We support the leisure-time music sector*** with practical services and musical resources, by celebrating and highlighting their achievements, by commissioning research and collating data, and by speaking on their behalf on a range of issues which affect them.

## **3 Background to the consultation**

- A) The [National Plan for Music Education](#), published in 2011 and valid until 2020, was conceived as a response to Darren Henley's [review of music education in England](#). It established as its vision:

*Our vision is to enable children from all backgrounds and every part of England to have the opportunity to learn a musical instrument; to make music with others; to learn to sing; and to have the opportunity to progress to the next level of excellence.*

And it was (is) looking to achieve:

- *Children from all backgrounds and every part of England should have the opportunity to learn a musical instrument; to make music with others; to learn to sing; and to have the opportunity to progress to the next level of excellence if they wish to.*
- *Music education is patchy across the country and change is needed to ensure all pupils receive a high quality music education.*
- *Teachers will have wide freedom in how they teach music in schools, but all schools should provide high quality music education as part of a broad and balanced curriculum.*
- *New music education hubs will take forward the work of local authority music services from September 2012, helping improve the quality and consistency of music education across England, both in and out of school.*
- *A National Plan monitoring board will hold to account those responsible for national-level delivery.*

As a consequence of that review and the plan, music education hubs (MEHs) came into existence in 2012. They have a wider remit than local authority music services used to have, and they are supposed to work in partnership with schools and professional and community music organisations in their locality to provide music education to all the young people in their area. There are 122 of them and they are funded by the Department for Education (DofE) via Arts Council England (ACE).

These are the agreed core and extension roles for these music education hubs:

*Core roles*

- a) Ensure that every child aged 5-18 within the hub area allocation has the opportunity to learn a musical instrument (other than voice) through whole-class ensemble teaching programmes for ideally a year (but for a minimum of a term) of weekly tuition on the same instrument*
- b) Provide opportunities to play in ensembles and to perform from an early age*
- c) Ensure that clear progression routes are made available and are affordable to all young people*
- d) Develop a singing strategy to ensure that every pupil sings regularly and that choirs and other vocal ensembles are available in the area*
- e) Have a School Music Education Plan in place that demonstrates how it will reach every school in its area*

*Extension roles*

- a) Offer Continuing professional development to school staff, particularly in supporting schools to deliver music in the curriculum*
- b) Provide an instrument loan service, with discounts or free provision for those on low incomes*
- c) Provide access to large scale and / or high quality music experiences for pupils, working with professional musicians and / or venues. This may include undertaking work to publicise the opportunities available to schools, parents/carers and students.*

In practice, it seems the results of this re-organisation of music education provision are:

- The patchiness of provision has not been resolved, some MEHs are excellent, others are not
- MEHs have been charged with interacting with schools, but very often schools don't want to know, because they're under pressure from so many other angles that they just can't cope, or indeed because they think they're already doing fine or better than the offer from the MEH
- Local authorities which until then had (mostly) supported music services have in many cases, what with their own worsening budgetary situation, taken this reorganization as an opportunity to stop/reduce their financial support for the

- music service/MEH, so actually the funding situation for MEHs is worse in some places than it was for music services before the reorganization
- Managers of music services who had until then been selected because they were excellent musicians and/or music educators, were suddenly required to run an organisation, including writing business plans, managing staff, raising funding etc., especially because many local authorities took this opportunity to actually force the music service to become an independent and stand-alone entity; this demands an entirely different skill set, and one not everyone previously leading a music service had or has
  - Partnership working has been patchy, as indeed our members have experienced, but not just our members; this may also in part be due to the fact that these newly-created (in many cases inexperienced) managers hadn't been required to work in this way before and were suddenly negotiating a whole new world of skills.
  - Learning an instrument in a whole class environment for one term – this being the minimum requirement for free provision – is absolutely not fit for purpose in terms of giving children sufficient skills to play an instrument for the rest of their life, with the benefits which are now well-researched, both for individuals and for their communities; and making families pay for tuition beyond that one term immediately excludes all those who cannot afford such tuition

The government is currently reviewing the National Plan for Music Education and plans to publish an update in 2019. The consultation Making Music undertook was therefore in part to gauge thinking amongst members about music education in the widest sense.

P.S.: clearly this plan is for England, but music education is also, in various forms, being discussed in Wales (which has just published a report by the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee on this topic: [Hitting the Right Note, Inquiry into the funding for and access to music education](#)), Scotland (there is a Music Education Partnership Group in the Scottish Parliament) and Northern Ireland. That was the reason for us framing the questions to the survey widely, so that whilst the starting points may be different in the four nations, the views members expressed would still usefully inform Making Music's advocacy on the subject.

- B) The [Music Commission](#) was launched in 2017 and concluded its public consultation in July. It is funded by ACE and was initiated by ABRSM. Its remit is UK-wide (not just England). Making Music disseminated the invitation to take part in their online survey and also held a focus group.

The commission is focused on 'exploring how to better sustain and support progress and progressing in learning music'.

Making Music made an online submission as well as submitting a report following the focus group.

We were particularly keen that the voice of the adult learner was heard in this consultation, so that was another reason for consulting members on music education and its barriers – for under- or over-18s – ahead of our submission.

- C) The [Music Education Council](#) (MEC) is the umbrella body for all organisations connected to music education in the UK (covers all four nations).

Making Music is and has been a member for a long time and MEC has also been consulting on the review of the National Plan for Music Education and holding various meetings to feed into a sector response. However, in our view this has been framed quite narrowly and does not address necessarily the most pressing issues on music education for under-18s or for

adults. That was another reason, therefore, for formulating our own questions and analyzing the results.

#### **4 The landscape of music education**

This is not Making Music's specialist area of expertise, so this is just to briefly state the types of music education channels, as a reminder and an overview.

Under-18s:

- Formal pre-school education (nurseries, Early Years settings)
- Private pre-school education (e.g. Monkey Music etc.)
- School education (curriculum, classroom)
- Private tuition on instruments including voice
- School extra-curricular activity (ensembles, instrument tuition)
- Out of school provision, e.g. Saturday music centres provided by music education hubs or local authorities or privately, offering tuition, ensembles, performance opportunities
- Out of school provision: ensembles, e.g. youth choirs, brass band training/youth band, youth orchestra, National Youth Folk Ensemble etc. etc.
- One-off opportunities as trigger points (e.g. Learn to Play Day etc.)
- Attendance at music events in school, local community, dedicated performing arts spaces, by peers, leisure-time musicians, professionals

Over-18s:

- At university or specialist music college, as an aspiring music professional
- At university as a leisure-time activity not related to subject study
- Provision in further and higher education colleges
- Provision in adult education colleges
- Private tuition
- Open access/beginner leisure-time music groups (e.g. Cobweb Orchestra, East London Late Starter Strings, many brass bands, ukulele groups, handbell ringers, drumming groups, community choirs etc.)
- Technically advanced leisure-time music groups
- Peer-to-peer teaching
- Trigger events/one-off opportunities (e.g. Learn to Play Day, Come and Sing events, Make Music Day participatory events)
- Attendance at music events in schools, local community, dedicated performing arts spaces by under-18s (e.g. own children, grandchildren), peers/leisure-time musicians, fellow learners (e.g. private tutor concert, adult education college event), professionals

#### **5 The results of Making Music's member consultation – the basics**

- Respondents: 155 responses (5% of members)
- **Music education is about... (in order of priority ranked by members)**
  - ...inspiring a love of music (97% agreed/strongly agreed)
  - ...enabling everyone to access music
  - ...listening and learning to appreciate music
  - ...all kinds of genres of music
  - ...music in schools
  - ...learning an instrument or learning to sing with a teacher
  - ...learning to make music by trying things out with your friends

- ...music theory and learning to read notes (64%)
- ...formal school qualifications (e.g. GCSEs, A-levels, Scottish Highers) (36%)
- ...creating the musical stars of tomorrow (33%)
- ...doing exams (18%)
- ...only classical music (3%)
- Free comments include:
  - *'Music education is part of an overall appreciation for the arts. It is about more than celebrity or stardom.'*
  - *'The pleasure of playing music together'*
  - *'Community and social inclusion'*
- There were no surprises in these answers, but interestingly whilst 'music in schools' was highly ranked, 'formal school qualifications' came in at no.9. Members, it may therefore seem, think that extra-curricular music activity based in schools is more important than music in the curriculum.
- **Music education is for....?**
  - Everyone! (not just children and young people; not just for the musical stars of tomorrow)
  - Noticeable here was the emphasis respondents placed on inclusivity and the need for additional resources to support those less able to access music (physically, financially etc.).
  - Comments in particular picked out issues of access –
    - *Absolutely everyone regardless of background, disability, ethnicity, financial resources*
    - *Totally inclusive-those with disabilities physical or mental or learning.*
    - *Those who face the biggest barriers deserve to have extra resources allocated - e.g. those in poverty, those with disabilities or health difficulties*
    - *Don't forget the disadvantaged and disabled! Make a point of including all ethnic and religious groups - their traditions are precious to us all*
- **Music education is important because...**
  - ... it opens up a world of benefits for individuals throughout their life in terms of their enjoyment, social connection, well-being etc.
  - ... it has benefits for children and young people beyond the musical learning itself
  - ... creativity, team-working skills, listening, problem-solving and tenacity are all developed through engaging with music, and are very important for any career
  - Only 3% of respondents thought that '... it's not important compared to other subjects and skills that children and young people need to learn to prepare them for life'
  - A selection of comments:
    - *...it can support many important issues e.g. teenage mental health, disabled learners accessing curriculum...*
    - *You meet like-minded individuals and gain a sense of identity*
    - *It nurtures self-esteem, resilience, concentration and so many other skills vital to a healthy, productive and contented life*
    - *It puts people in a receptive mood*
    - *Music is an international language*

## 6 Under-18s music education – barriers and how to address them

- **BARRIERS** What stands out is that 'quality of music teaching' is seen as the least of all worries, whereas it is something that the professional sector sees as a significant issue.

Also seen less as a problem is the lack of offer in terms of academic qualifications, in contrast to the focus of many campaigns (see Ebacc).

In our respondents' view, the top 3 issues are:

- Cost, in or outside school (lessons, instruments, tickets)
- The benefits of music education are not understood well enough by parents/carers and non-music staff in schools (e.g. other teachers/headship team)
- Schools do not offer enough non-classroom musical activity
- **Biggest challenges and barriers for successful participation in and engagement with music? (in order – worst to least significant problem)**
  - There is no/very little free music tuition for children in or outside school, so cost is a real issue (88%)
  - Schools are not offering enough music outside the classroom, e.g. in assemblies, ensembles etc. (74%)
  - Parents not understanding importance of music education, so not supporting it (e.g. by bringing children to events) (70%)
  - Not being able to access instruments for free/cheaply (70%)
  - Not enough understanding/support for music education from non-music staff in schools (70%)
  - Children aren't able to experience a wide range of music as part of their education (68%)
  - Schools are not offering enough music in the classroom/at GCSE/A-level to introduce children to music (62%)
  - Music education outside school not available or accessible due to location (e.g. rural) (51%)
  - Not enough access for children with disabilities (e.g. appropriate technology or suitable ensembles/bands) (42%)
  - Quality of music teaching is not good enough (25%)
  - Comments include:
    - *Music education needs to be modernised so more people can access but the traditional culture of learning an instrument and being part of a band/orchestra and striving for excellence with your peers still needs to be supported.*
    - *Trying to teach instruments in large classes - music teachers know it doesn't work for most instruments, and most children, so it puts them off completely.*
    - *If parents have no musical interest, children will only access knowledge at school.*
    - *Parents supporting children to practise, not saying it sounds awful and 'go and do it somewhere else'*
    - *Music education not taking on board the revolution of learning from recordings and YouTube and ignoring children and young people who self-educate in that way. We should be encouraging those who already self-educate to engage with others in and out of school and to sometimes have lessons and we should be encouraging increased independence and use of online sources of learning for those who don't already use them*
    - *Training of teachers NOT technology is the biggest barrier to inclusion of people with disabilities, including the huge numbers with Autism Spectrum Disorder whose potential is largely being missed. Technology has a role, I use it a lot but it is not THE answer.*
    - *Lack of understanding towards lyric writing and rap with almost no framework [for examiners] for awarding points in these skills. There is also too much focus on Western classical when the majority of jobs in the music industry are popular music based. Remembering when a composer is born is a history question not a music question.*



- *There is a big barrier in perception that music is expensive / only for some people / too hard.*
  - *Downplaying of importance of music education by government leading to parents believing that 'non-academic' subjects shouldn't be chosen for GCSE*
  - *Minority ethnic traditions (Asian, African etc.) are not well supported*
- **POTENTIAL SOLUTIONS?** Reflecting the main barriers cited above, respondents want to see:
    - free/heavily subsidised music tuition and instruments
    - better funding for extra-curricular music activity in schools
    - better education of non-music school staff and parents on the value of music
    - Their main concern, however, was that children should be able to attend a wide range of musical events in all kinds of genres, so as to discover the kind of music they most enjoy and want to engage with. This is interesting mainly because we have not seen this concern reflected in other organisations' campaigns, yet it is surely an obvious truism that you can't know what you love until you have an opportunity to find out about it. As important as providing accessible opportunities to young people and children would therefore seem to be exposing them to a great(er) range of musical experiences. Everyone likes some kind of music – but it might not be what's on offer in their school or the most obvious 'musics'. Free tickets and experiences provided via school should therefore also be an aim of lobbying.
  - **For under-18s, what needs to change, so that all children and young people have the opportunity to access music education? (ranked by number of responses highest to lowest)**
    - Children able to attend a wide range of musical events in all kinds of genres, so as to discover the kind of music they most enjoy and want to engage with (88%)
    - Schools to be funded/better funded for extra-curricular music activity (86%)
    - Free/heavily subsidised music tuition available to all children via school or music education hubs until age 18 (83%)
    - Instruments accessible free/cheaply through schools or music education hubs (79%)
    - Better education of non-music teachers/headteachers/governors on value of music education (71%)
    - Better education of parents/carers to understand the importance of music education (70%)
    - Music to be included in Ebacc/more prominent in curriculum etc., so as to be taken seriously by schools/universities (68%)
    - Better qualified music educators, in and out of school/curriculum (53%)
    - More use of music technology to enable children with disabilities or in remote locations or with limited financial means to access music education (42%)
    - Comments – a flavour:
      - *Making music should be seen as fun, as well as skilful - in other words, students who are not intending to "study" music should be encouraged to sing and play as part of their social life. A lot of teenagers form bands, but have trouble finding places to practise where they're not seen as a nuisance - use of school space for noisy activity, especially after school hours, might help*
      - *Opportunities for children to access live music at reasonable rates. Sometimes tickets prohibitive in cost*
      - *A bigger range of qualifications offered in various musical skills and disciplines*
      - *Impress upon parents the importance of musical activities*
      - *Children choose their own music as a background to homework, study and*

*revision, the same could be done in schools in controlled environments, exposing youngsters to a range of voices, instruments, genres and letting each work out for themselves which ones appeal*

- *Using class music as a basis for establishing a musical tradition in the school ensures that the subject is taken seriously by other staff and forms the basis for instrumental/choral work which can then be showcased by giving concerts - so involving the parents*
- *Make it fun*

## **7 Adult music education – challenges and how to overcome them**

### **• *Barriers for successful engagement with and participation in music for adults***

Overwhelmingly, the biggest barrier, for complete beginners or 'returners' is lack of confidence. This is also the finding from our research on what prevents 18-35 year olds joining leisure-time music groups, so this barrier is not exclusive to younger adults.

Other issues affecting adult participation in music are:

- lack of awareness that participation in music is an option for them (even if they've never played or sung before)
- lack of knowledge of what options there are for adults wanting to learn an instrument or learn to sing or join/set up a music group
- lack of opportunities in their locality to access music education
- lack of time
- cost (60% agree/strongly agree)
- affordable instruments
- lack of opportunity in their locality to join a group
- practice space (45% agree/strongly agree)

### **• *Comments – a flavour:***

- *Lack of inspiration - adults picking up musical instruments or restarting are unaware of their potential*
- *Underneath the confidence issue is often a belief going back to their experience of education at school that they are not any good at music*
- *Lack of people to run groups. Lack of suitable places to run them (which aren't already fully booked.) Performance opportunities*
- *If people really want to do something they find the time and the money to do it. More education is needed to advertise the musical opportunities that there are already*
- *As music (and the arts in general) are continually downgraded by Government, it is pushed to the bottom of people's time priority, as they believe it has little real value*
- *No awareness when in full time education of the pathways to community music*
- *The biggest challenge for an adult is to learn to read music from scratch*
- *Practice space can be a real issue- could employers be encouraged to provide this?*
- *My experience is with classical music: adults don't engage with coming to classical music concerts because it's not something they've ever done and they are worried that they will find it boring & that it's not for them. If they don't listen/attend, then they are much less likely to want to join in/learn/perform.*

### **• *What might help remove those barriers?***

This open question threw up lots of practical, useful suggestions which Making Music

and others can consider how to put into practice. They include:

- more open access beginner music groups (and collective information about them)
- more opportunities for adults to try out/have a go/encounter music-making adults, to take away fear and raise awareness of possibilities within their reach (inspiration and 'trigger events')
- campaigns from top down with messages on benefits of music-making for all
- TV exposure of the kind which has done so much for choirs
- inspirational activities/role models
- intergenerational projects (also help under-18s)
- music education hubs offering activities for all ages
- funding
- affordable adult music tuition and instruments
- availability of affordable way to learn to read music and develop aural skills
- peer-to-peer learning opportunities
- support from employers (e.g. practice rooms, workplace ensembles etc.)
- A selection of comments/themes below
  - *Networks of "late-starters" organisations similar to ELLSO. Should be affiliated to a central hub, rather than ad-hoc with the learner having to seek them out individually.*
  - *More groups aimed at adult beginners/returners.*
  - *Reliable website for accessing music lessons and groups*
  - *Run sessions encouraging adults back to playing where music is of a low level as a means of gentle re-introduction to playing and with other players who are in a similar situation*
  - *One-off taster sessions in community settings;*
  - *'Have a go at an instrument' day*
  - *Street & shopping centre performances*
  - *Bite-size chunks (not whole works) - taster sessions - use of social media before to publicise the "famous bits" or the "most exciting bits" so that people feel they will recognise some of the tunes and enjoy the rest of the work*
  - *Try-out days or workshops.*
  - *Family singing days*
  - *More opportunities to try out an instrument in public spaces like village halls and libraries, the Ukelele bands have done this very successfully!*
  - *Creating a vision from top down of the importance of music education for all – and the benefits, incl. e.g. good mental health and wellbeing. At least 12 comments on this.*
  - *General awareness raising/publicity using local press and local media. This needs to be regular not a one off campaign. More publicity for community music events on a larger scale. There were 15+ comments on this theme*
  - *Something on TV along lines of baking, sewing, painting etc series where members of the public have a go at 'artistic' skills; role models and inspirational activities have an important role to play - e.g Gareth Malone and similar things on telly backed up by good quality opportunities on the ground.*
  - *The growth of community choirs has been a huge success story but it had deep roots in training and development of leaders and of good practice, going back many decades.*
  - *School performances, mixing adults (parents, carers, grand-parents, older siblings, ex-pupils) and pupils in school orchestras, choirs and other music-making, nothing makes the point like singing or playing trumpet alongside your kid's games teacher! If children have better opportunities they can inspire their parents*
  - *Time is the greatest difficulty but the early retired or families whose children have grown up need to be encouraged (back) into music*
  - *Better work-life balance across society*

- *Funding, investment for community-based musical activity/adult music opportunities/local music/inclusive music activity.* There were 10+ comments on this.
- *Hubs offering all age activities*
- *Reasonably priced adult education*
- *If really good cross-genre tuition in music reading was easily accessible, far more people would go on to join choirs or study instruments. But it's far more than "rudiments" - aural skills must be built in*
- *Start learning with a friend or neighbour - sharing the experience*
- *A couple of one to one sessions might remove the anxiety?*

## 8 Music Education Hubs and leisure-time music groups

The last part of our survey focussed on **music education hubs** (England), to find out some more quantitative data on their interaction with leisure-time music groups.

- 44% of respondents hadn't even heard of music education hubs until the survey;
- 22% had contacted their nearest hub, resulting in some action
- 7% had been contacted by the music education hub, resulting in some action

Asked how much interaction they had had with their hub since it was set up in 2012...

- 66% stated they'd had none at all
- 18% had an ongoing partnership, with regular contact or events
- 10% had had a one-off meeting or event or action (in the past)
- 3% only were even doing mutual signposting.

Given that fewer than 5% of under-18s go on to become professional musicians, it seems surprising that music education hubs do not engage with the rich landscape of leisure-time musical activity located around them, both to make use of it for the music education of the under-18s and to ensure a legacy of the work the hub will have put into these young people over a period of 13 years – signposting them to community musical activity they can take part in for the rest of their lives.

79% of respondents were keen to engage with music education hubs – but the biggest barrier was not knowing anything about them, how to contact them or how to, potentially, interact with them or build a partnership.

What seems surprising is that, despite many teachers and leaders in hubs also running community music groups, or taking part in them, the hubs, after 6 years of operation, have yet to recognise the potential of harnessing the knowledge, experience and huge enthusiasm of music groups and their members to achieve the aims of their own organisations and benefit the young people they are educating.

- **Your local MEH – do you know (of) it?**
  - no we did not know about music education hubs until this survey (44%)
  - yes we know of it/that it exists but have never got in touch (22%)
  - yes we have contacted it, resulting in some action (22%)
  - yes the music education hub contacted us, resulting in some action (7%)
  - yes we know of it and have had contact, but nothing came of it (5%)
  - yes we know of it and have tried to make contact, but this has been unsuccessful (3%)
- **What has been your interaction with your music education hub since 2012?**
  - None (66%)
  - ongoing partnership, regular contact or events (18%)
  - one-off meeting or event or action (in the past) (10%)
  - mutual signposting (ongoing) (3%)

- one-off meeting or event or action (just happening now) (2%)
- some more detail from a number of respondents, because it illustrates the potential in some cases, and the waste of potential in others:
  - *partnership working in sharing players and assets such as events and instruments etc.*
  - *hub gave our orchestra a grant to subsidise child tickets for a music event*
  - *occasional pathway for under-18s to experience playing with our adult orchestra*
  - *festival has an ongoing connection with the music hub for them to publicise out bursary scheme for young musicians; has invited county music ensembles to give a concert as part of the festival programme; publicised education events organised by the festival*
  - *formation of The Young Singers with the Tri-borough music hub, Kensington and Chelsea, Hammersmith and Fulham*
  - *members of my local orchestra (Petersfield) have played in Mahler Symphony 'in a day' events organised by Hampshire Music Service and the BSO*
  - *What is it?*
  - *No idea if it exists*
  - *It is run once a week in a local school. It has only a few children attending. None have come to our events despite encouragement. The local school took part in an event with us. Chatting to the music teacher, giving him my contact details etc. did not lead to any further contact or young musicians coming along to one of our rehearsals.*
  - *I am on the advisory board but it is being VERY badly run at the moment, because the county council have held onto it but have just tacked it onto the job description of someone who already has far too much to do. She won't admit what a mess it is. The lead partners are reasonably OK with this because they can just go on doing what they want to do and what fits with their existing staffing without any challenge. The whole focus of resources on weak models of first access has been a hidden disaster. Everyone makes it want to look good. The Music Mark recent research was useful, but very limited in scope as it did not ask children and young people, parents or schools! Nearly all the evidence came from those with a vested interest in the current system continuing hence the call for progression to be dropped as a success criteria. It should be about long term progression and growth as musicians and should be compared with baseline measures of how many children would take up lessons etc. without hub funded WCET/First access programmes. There are some brilliant ways in which this core outcome could be achieved if the prescriptive restraint was removed and some pressure put on to really evidence that outcome.*
  - *My attempts at contacting my local hub with a view to co-operation have met with silence!*
  - *We are working with them re 2020 and Wordsworth's 250 anniversary. We have made most of the running, but they are hoping to provide in-kind contributions for the concert. We are also involving them in a schools project to ensure no clashes. Individual members of the hub have been involved with our performances as musicians*
  - **Very aware of what we do.**  
**There when we need them.**  
**Proactive in youth field.**  
**Responsive to approaches in adult field.**
  - *I was aware of the music education hub because my child learned an instrument through school / the local music service, but I had never thought of*

*suggesting that my choir should contact it. The choir offers a scholarship for young singers but this hadn't been taken up for at least 3 years*

- *I have contacted all the hubs in the Merseyside area on two occasions but none of them even responded*
  - *Leicester Symphony orchestra played a family orientated concert called animal antics - the hub provided the pre-concert activities - try an instrument. We - the LSO decided to offer family tickets - 2 adults and up to 3 children for this concert and will be repeating this offer throughout next season. Some of our players are instrument teachers in the hub. The hub advertised in our programme as well as providing instruments for families to try*
  - *Borrowed an instrument and have attended regular primary level concerts of different musical types fairly regularly. Are aware of and have spoken to staff outside of events also*
  - *How does a local adult choir interact with a music hub? Are there examples of good practice?*
  - *Our choral society has worked closely with our local music hub in providing children's choirs to join us for two concerts now. I have recommended their services to another musical group that needed a children's choir. I have also established that, if we take longer than anticipated in appointing our next Musical Director, the hub can provide a temporary conductor!*
  - *I was chairman of a 100 strong choir from 2014-2017. I have vaguely heard of this hub, but had no idea what it was for.*
  - *Regular concerts for our society, given by the students - "win-win" as all the parents come to those specific events and get to know more about our society and the students gain experience of rehearsing and playing for a real audience.*
- **Do you think you should interact with the music education hub in your area? If yes, how?**
    - *yes we'd like to interact with the music education hub (79%)*
    - *no we're not interested in doing anything with the music education hub (21%)*
    - *62 comments! A flavour...*
      - *Which hub do we contact?*
      - *We need to find out more about it. Not sure what this is. Many comments on this theme!*
      - *It's a 'yes but...' because as an amateur organisation we have very limited time and resources for anything beyond our own concert season. Many comments pointing out that community music groups are volunteer-run and therefore have little capacity to be pro-active in this relationship.*
      - *It's tricky...we are a small orchestra and have few openings ourselves but being able to collaborate in an inventive way with other music groups in a community based activity would be good...*
      - *Because we could offer them and the youngsters in the region a great deal of opportunity and valuable experience*
      - *Is there any point when we have tried in the past and nothing has happened*
      - *As a music society we not only offer free tickets to young people attending our concerts but also offer much reduced tickets to their parents. Although we do not have the help or resources to offer masterclasses or workshops, we still feel that young people would benefit from attending concerts featuring outstanding musicians in a very relaxed and friendly atmosphere. We have tried to liaise with our local hub about this - but to no avail*
      - *We would certainly like to have more young people at our concerts.*
      - *Our group - a chamber choir - is well aware of the need to find the next*

generation of performers, as well of the next generation of audience. Far too few people imagine that either performing in or attending musical events such as ours would enhance their lives.

- **The Music Hub should be promoting music education for ALL ages, not just a schools provision. It should be promoting music events (concerts, workshops), setting up choirs, orchestras, recitals, etc.**
- **There are organisations in the community that can continue music education. Other organisations are not a threat for the music hubs and are an opportunity to develop a continuum far beyond the 14 years of state education - music in the community is often for the next 60+ years of a person's life. Listening to community music encourages community involvement and has no boundaries, being cross generational.**
- *Potential audience development for us and opportunities for children and families to come to hear a live orchestra*
- *Engage more fully with the community - get young people enthused - build relationships with other music educators*
- *Important to develop a partnership & work together in community & support each other's work & events*
- *Assistance with finding music we could perform together would be useful. This is something that many adult groups could do.*
- *From our choral society's point of view, we would need a member who was really keen to be in contact with the hub and it is difficult getting people to take on such roles.*
- *I'd like to engage young instrumentalists with adult music groups*
- *They could come to listen to a rehearsal and talk to the musicians*
- *The music hub could provide music for all generations and become a real community asset...*
- *We can offer performance opportunities, occasional education events and publicise the bursary scheme. The hub can publicise our concerts and events*
- *We already do. Workshops in local schools, free tickets for concerts, bursary competition for young musicians*
- *Collaborate with community projects...take instruments into schools to play for young people so they can hear what instruments sound like...perform small pieces of chamber music*
- *We can offer players of orchestral instruments some experience in our locality, rather than a student having to travel to large town for youth orchestra/ensemble and we are cheaper!*
- *Maybe more advanced students to 'sit in' on rehearsals. We already offer free tickets to 18 and under - will promote this to local hub*
- *We do lots in school but do it alone, networking & support would be amazing*
- *We have a tremendous amount of professional experience and expertise - but the hub are simply not interested...*
- *Demonstration by small (3 or 4 people) groups of different instruments to let pupils identify each and possibly have a go but only if follow up was going to be possible*
- *I'm MD of a choral society and desperate to get more youngsters into my choir*
- *I wish we had a decent advisory board, so that my time and contribution was better used*
- *Not sure how we could help music education in our area. Hosting a 'come and sing'? Singing in schools? Hub could offer workshops - personally I would like to know more about how to cope with an ageing voice!*

- *As a concert managing society we should be keeping hubs up to speed with our concert programme for the holidays, and exploring with them how they believe we can help participation and learning*
- *Invite them to come and sing with us*
- *They can provide performance opportunities, bringing performers together. They foster non-competitive working with other groups. We already make a very large contribution to the music education of under 18s in our area*
- *As a means of introducing youngsters to light popular music through a project, e.g. as conductor, I could be working with the hub on chosen pieces and then bringing the youngsters to work alongside the Promenade Concert Orchestra players in the area and concerts from time to time. Could also have an associate membership for those wishing to play in the orchestra, but not fully confident or proficient, where they would sit alongside seasoned players gaining confidence for them to eventually take part in a concert.*
- *We could invite young people to our concerts for a very reduced fee. It would be difficult for people in our orchestra to go to music hubs because most of the members are working during the daytime.*
- *Subsidised or free tickets for our concerts (student's ticket currently £2); under-18s to attend orchestral rehearsal (prior to concert on Saturday afternoon or evening rehearsal) and talk with players at interval, family concerts*
- *My involvement with music is exclusively with adults, however, it would be good to have links with the hubs to give school leavers options of joining adult groups after they have left the hub*
- *Introduce adult groups to schools & colleges; joint projects (rehearsals and performances)*
- *I don't think it is so easy for an adult organisation to see the benefits.....as I said we saw the hub through school and it worked well. I think that it would be an excellent idea for area hubs to contact local groups and suggest a variety of ways to interact i.e. suggesting that a local school choir, for instance, could take part in their concert. This would have the benefit of bringing the ages together to make music, giving the juniors experience in taking part in a semi/professional concert, increasing audience numbers as the juniors would be supported by family etc - the possibilities are there for the taking!*
- *There could be more social media promotion between us and the hub*
- *We could offer 'pop-up' choral experiences linked to our upcoming performances. We could provide expert training in topics where school staff may not have expertise. We could engage with Arts Mark-type activity, providing experience in planning and delivering arts events - young people could provide skills we lack e.g. in IT (websites, YouTube etc.)*
- *We enjoy singing with school choirs and they seem to have enjoyed singing with us. The parents and families also help to swell our audience! This is certainly a way to get children interested in joining an adult choir when they are older. We aim to choose programmes that will sometimes include a children's choir and would like to include workshops for the children on the day of the concert when they are not needed for rehearsal.*
- *Provide opportunities in wider community for up and coming new players.*
- *Our group is keen to stimulate young people's interest in the organ and its music. Meeting with key people from the hub would be a first step.*
- *We hope to perform at least one concert a year jointly with the school singers. The students will benefit perhaps from joining with an experienced group, or being able to perform larger works that they are unable to perform on their own. We hope to offer the school music department some funding towards*



*relevant musical education, e.g. singing lessons at school, or to purchase sheet music. They would have free access to our extensive music library. We benefit from helping to educate and encourage our choral singers of the future, as without them we will have no choir. We should all have an enjoyable experience. We may be able to use the school hall which would save £1,000 that we might normally pay for hall hire elsewhere.*